

ANNEX 4: NPD REVIEW TABLES

CAMBODIA

(Full NPD dated October 2010)

GOVERNANCE OF REDD+

*To what extent does the R-PP promote good governance within REDD+ systems and processes?***Stakeholder participation in REDD+ planning and implementation**

- + *Identifies relevant stakeholders for REDD+*
- + *Specifically considers how to engage vulnerable groups*
- + *Establishes procedures to ensure a transparent process and accountability for stakeholder input*
- + *Establishes a grievance / dispute resolution mechanism*
- + *Considers how to learn and build from other relevant participatory processes*

The NPD contains a strong commitment to effective stakeholder consultation processes. A detailed analysis of key stakeholder groups identifies government, civil society and NGOs, the private sector, knowledge institutions, international networks and donors is provided (p44-50), with particular emphasis on the need to engage potentially vulnerable groups, such as women and indigenous groups, and the importance of grassroots communication.

The NPD states that development of the Cambodia Readiness Plan Proposal, or Roadmap (the NPD clarifies that this document is similar to an R-PP but that Cambodia has not yet officially submitted an R-PP to the FCPF), was an important milestone in achieving effective stakeholder engagement (p9). The NPD provides a list of lessons learned from past consultation processes such as the one conducted on the National Forestry Programme. These lessons include the need for early engagement of stakeholders, making information available and easily understandable, use of well-trained facilitators and ensuring responses to comments raised in meetings (p71). Finally, the NPD clearly outlines the process and timeline used for stakeholder consultations to develop the Roadmap, including stakeholder mapping and initial awareness raising activities and a phase of small scale consultations that culminated in a national workshop in September 2010.

The NPD notes that the government has responsibility for conflict resolution, and there are some dedicated mechanisms for resolving land and forest management disputes; however, it is not clear whether these specific mechanisms are only for resource-related conflict or would also be used for stakeholder grievances.

Recommendation:

- Clarify whether a dispute resolution mechanisms are accessible for resolving stakeholder conflicts

Government coordination in REDD+ planning and implementation

- + *Considers REDD+ in the context of other sector policies, land use plans, and national development plans*
- + *Proposes a process to reconcile potential conflicts between REDD+ strategies and other policies/plans*
- + *Proposes effective mechanisms to coordinate REDD+ across sectors*
- + *Proposes effective mechanisms to coordinate REDD+ across levels of government*

The NPD clearly outlines the need to integrate REDD+ into other ongoing national strategies such as the National Forestry Programme, and includes a thorough discussion of some of the initiatives that are relevant to REDD+ activities (p19-24). The NPD states that the development of the REDD+ Roadmap represented an important standard for inter-ministerial cooperation and was led by a group of government agencies that include relevant departments from the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and the Ministry of the Environment (p9). Coordination across government sectors as well as other stakeholder groups is a high priority for the NPD, which notes that in order to improve coordination some capacity building efforts will be necessary to improve effectiveness.

Some potential conflicts exist with other priorities such as agricultural expansion and infrastructure development, but a range of

CAMBODIA

(Full NPD dated October 2010)

institutions already exist to help handle intersectoral coordination and conflict. A list of these existing coordinating bodies that may be relevant to REDD+ is provided in the NPD, and many of these entities play a role in managing conflicts over land and could therefore be important to managing conflicts between sectors with competing land use agendas (p42). An interim REDD+ Taskforce has been created to lead coordination efforts and ensure “balanced discussion” between government agencies (p45). The NPD also stressed the importance of coordinating across different levels of government, although it does not go into significant detail about proposed mechanisms for achieving this.

Recommendation:

- Provide more detail on proposed processes or mechanisms for coordinating across levels of government

Transparent and accountable REDD+ revenue management & benefit sharing

- + *Proposes a transparent system to track and coordinate international financing of activities related to REDD+*
- + *Considers measures to promote fiscal transparency and accountability for REDD+ revenue management*
- + *Proposes a transparent process for deciding who should benefit from REDD+ and how benefits will be targeted*
- + *Reviews lessons from past and/or existing systems for managing and distributing forest revenues*

Existing pilot projects in Cambodia have already begun to develop transparent benefit-sharing arrangements with forest communities (p8), and the NPD states that there are other examples of benefit distribution mechanisms that are not specific to REDD+ that should be studied such as an existing Protected Area Trust Fund. The NPD proposes to further explore financing models and revenue sharing arrangements as part of its key outputs (p80,91). The NPD suggests the need to create models for revenue distribution at three different levels: mechanisms for funds entering the country, mechanisms to disburse funds to line agencies, and methods for making performance-based payments to local communities for reducing deforestation and forest degradation (p91). The NPD proposes establishment of a Benefit-Sharing Technical Team that will carry out documentation of existing examples and explore potential options for REDD+ revenue sharing, which will also be consulted on with stakeholders (p91). The establishment of a REDD+ fund is also put forth as a potential strategy, noting the importance of ensuring that fund management is transparent and governance responsibilities are clear (p91).

Recommendation:

- Provide more detail on any lessons learned from implementation of existing funds and pilot projects

Transparent monitoring and oversight of REDD+

- + *Proposes to establish information management systems for REDD+ that guarantee public access to information*
- + *Proposes mechanisms for independent oversight of the implementation of REDD+ activities*
- + *Proposes mechanisms to monitor efforts to address governance challenges*

The NPD plans to establish a transparent national monitoring system, and providing access to information on REDD+ and the readiness process is an important planned output of the National Joint Programme (p89). The NPD states that training and awareness-raising was requested by stakeholders for more effective participation in REDD+ strategy development, therefore development of more effective communication tools is foreseen as an activity to be completed. Development of knowledge-sharing mechanisms such as a website is also proposed by the NPD.

The NPD develops a REDD+ implementation framework that will help clarify roles and responsibilities for REDD+ activities; a Cambodia REDD+ Taskforce comprised of representatives from multiple government agencies will be responsible for some coordination and technical support activities, as well as the overall management of the REDD+ readiness process (p88). Plans to monitor REDD+ activities include the need to measure impacts and benefits of REDD+ implementation, including safeguards. The NPD identifies the need to develop social-, environmental- and governance-related indicators that can be used to monitor implementation impacts (p95).

CAMBODIA

*(Full NPD dated October 2010)***Recommendation:**

- Clarify whether civil society, indigenous peoples or other non-government stakeholders could have membership on the REDD+ Taskforce

GOVERNANCE CHALLENGES FOR ADDRESSING DEFORESTATION DRIVERS*To what extent does the R-PP consider key forest governance challenges for achieving REDD+?***Land and forest tenure**

- + *Discusses the situation regarding land and forest tenure, including for indigenous peoples*
- + *Considers the capacity of judicial and non-judicial systems to resolve conflicts and uphold the rights of citizens*
- + *Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework*

The NPD provides a thorough assessment of the current tenure situation in Cambodia. Tenure arrangements include private forest areas, which can include lands that have been transferred to indigenous populations through communal land titling procedures (p13), as well as the Permanent Forest Reserve, which is state land and comprised of Conservation, Protection and Production forest areas. The NPD also notes that some Community Protected Areas have co-management arrangements with local communities (p14). The 2001 Land Law created a system of land titling, including a specific procedure for registration of land for indigenous communities (p28). Despite the existence of titling programs and co-management arrangements, the NPD states that in some places landlessness has increased in Cambodia. Furthermore, migration of populations back to rural areas and an open access mentality with respect to forest resources further contribute to insecure tenure and forest clearing. Lack of clear boundaries, limited implementation of land registration processes and poor land use planning are all governance weaknesses that contribute to these problems.

A variety of mechanisms exist in Cambodia for dealing with land disputes, and the NPD states that a Sub-Decree on State Land Management outlines a process for determining clear ownership of any land, including processes to resolve disputes. Various land conflict resolution mechanisms are also catalogued, although more information could be provided on the accessibility and effectiveness of these mechanisms.

The REDD+ strategy outline in the NPD suggests that prioritizing activities such as Community Forests, Community Protected Areas and other forms of community management are intended to support tenure reform. The NPD proposes to further investigate drivers for forest loss, including investigating how to integrate REDD+ into community forest regulations and how to link REDD+ with land use planning, but could provide more detail on whether legal frameworks for tenure need to be clarified.

Recommendations:

- Clarify whether any legal or policy review of tenure arrangements is necessary for REDD+
- Indicate whether existing mechanisms for resolving land disputes are effective accessible to a range of stakeholders

Forest Management

- + *Discusses the ability of forest agencies to plan and implement forest management activities*
- + *Considers the role of different stakeholders, including communities, in forest management*
- + *Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework*

The NPD notes that lack of implementation of laws and policies for forest management contributes to the rapid pace of deforestation in Cambodia (p8). A new National Forest Programme has been developed to manage the permanent forest estates, and the NPD states that REDD+ could provide an important source of financing for this program. Some community forestry has been attempted as a way to manage forest resources more sustainably, although these initiatives are still relatively new and the process for registration and approval of community forests tends to be time-intensive (p17). Attempted reforms in 2000s

CAMBODIA

(Full NPD dated October 2010)

introduced a moratorium on logging, and many concessions have been cancelled or are not currently operating.

The NPDs identify existing forest management challenges, including lack of management plans for protected areas, lack of financial and human resources, low institutional capacity, and lack of incentives for sustainable forest management. The NPD states that efforts have been made to address poor management and capacity constraints by enhancing cooperation between local communities, protected area managers and other partners (p18). The NPD also describes ongoing efforts to improve sub-national governance through decentralization and deconcentration (p20). The NPD outlines several activities for addressing some of the identified challenges through enhancing activities of the National Forestry Programme, integrating REDD+ into management plans and building capacity for REDD+ at sub-national levels through pilot activities and a province-wide capacity building scheme (p90-92).

Forest Law Enforcement

+ Discusses the ability of law enforcement bodies to effectively enforce forest laws

Discusses efforts to combat corruption

+ Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework

Improving law enforcement and governance to address issues such as illegal logging is identified as an ongoing priority for the forest sector and some efforts have already been established (p17). For example, a logging moratorium and a new monitoring system for domestic wood have been implemented by the Forest Administration. The NPD states that efforts to improve law enforcement will depend on the Forest Crime Monitoring Unit and their capacity to implement enforcement activities. Nonetheless, capacity to monitor and enforce still need to be strengthened, and these are priorities of the current National Forestry Programme, which has Forest Law Enforcement and Governance as one of its six programmatic objectives (p21). Specific law enforcement strategies are not thoroughly discussed in the NPD's proposed outputs, although it suggests that forest law enforcement and governance improvements could be part of pilot projects and capacity building efforts.

Corruption is mentioned as an issue that exacerbates problems in the forest sector, but the NPD notes that these issues have largely been unaddressed and does not propose further efforts to do so as part readiness.

Recommendations:

- Provide more detail on potential strategies for improving law enforcement efforts
- Discuss problems of corruption in the forest sector more thoroughly and how these issues might be effectively addressed

Other Forest Governance Issues Relevant for REDD+

+ Discusses other forest governance issues that are relevant for REDD+

+ Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy and implementation framework

The NPD provides a thorough and thoughtful analysis of the existing situation regarding forest governance and management in Cambodia, and clearly links identified forest governance challenges for REDD+ to the ongoing efforts to address forest governance as part of existing strategies such as the National Forestry Programme. Moving forward, further efforts to identify concrete strategies for improving governance could further strengthen readiness planning efforts.

Recommendation:

- As the REDD+ Roadmap is further developed, develop more concrete strategy recommendations around improving forest governance such as targeted capacity-building strategies or specific ways to promote accountability and transparency in the forest sector.