

**UN-REDD**  
PROGRAMME



# Independent Technical Review: Colombia R-PP document

---

UN-REDD PROGRAMME

---

Reviewer: Tomas Schlichter

Date: May 30<sup>th</sup> 2013

---

**General comments to R-PP Document of [insert country name] (maximum 200 words):**

The R-PP document is very well written and comprehensive. It accomplishes most of the requirements of an R-PP. The proposed institutional arrangement is sound and includes the participation, at different levels, of National and regional institutions as well as work groups that include almost all the involved stakeholders. It may be convenient to include in the institutional framework also those actors involved in the main activities causing deforestation, as mining companies as well as organizations that represent peasants and livestock ranchers.

Consultation plans is still to be carried out. It will involve the main actors, and is very comprehensive and well planned.

Drivers of deforestation are well identified, though the document itself recognizes that more work is needed to clearly quantify the magnitude of each of them for each region, and that the model conducing to the construction of the reference level will need more input about conditions that result in incentives for the main drivers.

The development of reference level as well as the MRV (for carbon as well as environmental and socioeconomic aspects) is described with detail and in a very clear way.

Colombia has identified several sources of funding, among them also the government of the country, and this is clearly a positive aspect of its program, demonstrating ownership by the country.

---

## Assessing the draft R-PP against review criteria

(Please refer to the TORs and supporting documents)

### 1. Ownership of the Programme (maximum 150 words):

i. Ownership of the R-PP by government and non-government stakeholders.

As stated in the note at the first page, the document includes opinions of many involved actors, as the communities depending in some way on forests, diverse productive sectors, representatives of civil societies and the government. It includes also results of a recent event (May 9 and 10 2013), that was carried out as part of the preparation of the National Strategy for REDD+ (ENREDD+). Some results of this meeting are included in this version of the document.

Colombia develops its Program according to four main strategies or policies

- Strategy for low carbon development
- National Strategy for REDD+
- National Plan for the adaptation to climate change
- Strategy for financial protection given natural disasters

All these strategies are part of the National Development plan (2010- 2014), and all REDD+ activities are foreseen to be consistent with this plan. This is, as example, the case with the subnational nested approach for most of the activities

Colombia participates in the financing of the Program with a little less than a 10% of the total budget, which may be considered a satisfying indicator of the involvement of the country in this process.

It seems that the country has a strong ownership of the program, at the governmental level. Ownership by local communities and NGOS, needs to be developed, and the consultation plan may be the mean by which this can be developed.

### 2. Level of consultation, participation and engagement (maximum 150 words):

As mentioned before the authors stress that the present version of the program document includes opinions of various interest groups, including indigenous peoples, afro- Colombian communities productive sectors and governmental institutions.

As for early dialogue and information, annex 1b(3) , page 211, provides a list of meetings, with organizations of different levels, at different regions of the country. The table includes date of the meeting, name of participant organizations and conclusions of the event. Participants include not only communities that depend of forests but also armed forces, NGOs, governmental officials. Early dialogue has been concentrated in two regions: Amazonia and Pacific.

With respect to consultation, the document presents a comprehensive plan for this issue, but actions had not began yet, and it seems to be a part of the construction of the ENREDD+ of Colombia.

---

3. Programme effectiveness and cost efficiency (maximum 100 words):

It seems that the Program has a high probability of being effective. The document presents a sound institutional arrangement, and the critical components are analyzed with detail. For a country with a high social and ecological heterogeneity and with a mean deforestation rates of more than 300,000 has per year, it seems that the proposed budget (adding all donors) is the adequate to reach the conditions that may diminish deforestation.

Strategic options are described with some detail and seem to address the main drivers of deforestation. Therefore these options may be effective in diminishing actual rates of deforestation for the country. Cost effectiveness will be analyzed at the national and regional level during the implementation phase.

4. Management of risks and likelihood of success (maximum 150 words):

Risks are considered with respect to several items along the document. It is planed to follow the guidelines of UN- REDD+ to evaluate corruption risks, and for this purpose the budget considers the hiring of a consultancy to propose an adequate institutional arrangement, and prevent this risk. Also the aspect will be treated in workshops and meetings with communities and other involved stakeholders.

On the other hand, prevention of risks is described with detail along the component 2 d (development of SESA). In this section it is proposed to analyze risks and benefits associated with strategy options (2b) on Social Capital, Human Capital, Financial Capital, Physical Capital and Natural Capital.

The wide participatory process that is planned increases the likelihood of success, although this issue is not described with detail in a section of the document.

It is also to be considered that the, until now, not solved internal problems in Colombia may constitute a risk for the implementation of many activities of the Program.

---

5. Consistency with the UN-REDD Programme Strategy (maximum 150 words):

The R-PP is consistent with the 6 work areas of the UN- REDD Strategy- MRV considers the capacitation and participation of local communities, and the consideration of governance issues (although more detail would be welcomed with respect to monitoring governance) . For this purpose it plans to get support from FAO and UNEP. MRV will monitor also the safeguards that the country is developing based on international standards and national legislation. Indigenous peoples, afro-Colombian communities and farmers will integrate the national workgroup REDD+ (Mesa Nacional REDD+). Four thematic REDD+ workgroups will be also generated, integrating these mentioned stakeholders as well as NGOs. Monitoring will consider also aspects as biodiversity and other ecosystem services, and the country will need to decide which tradeoffs are acceptable. No explanation is provided at this point about criteria to accept, or reject, tradeoffs between diminishing emissions at the cost of other environmental or social aspects. Mechanisms to ensure transparency are going to be developed also considering the safeguards. Mechanism to solve conflicts and grievances are also going to be created during the implementation phase but the country already has legal mechanisms to deal with these aspects.

Under the strategy options (2b) several actions are oriented to the sustainable management of forests, sound ecologically land use planning, the promotion of sustainable agriculture, and ecotourism, contributing in this way to the transformation of the forest sector, with an orientation to the development of a Green Economy .

6. Compliance with UN-REDD Programme Rules of Procedure and Operational Guidance (maximum 150 words):

It seems that the document was formulated consulting the UN representatives, and in many cases with consultation or assistance of the corresponding UN Agencies.

The document was presented in the meeting of May 9-10, 2013. In this event participated many representatives of indigenous communities, afro-Colombian communities, NGOs, donors and governmental organizations. Many observations to the document were made by the different actors, and some of them are included in the version 7.1 of the document.

The document presents in section 6.b the UN monitoring framework, in a very detailed way.

---

## Assessing the draft R-PP by component

(Please refer to the TORs and supporting documents)

1. Component 1: Organize and consult (maximum 300 words):

The preparation of the National Strategy of REDD+ (ENREDD+) for Colombia is aligned with national policies as the National Development Strategy 2010- 2014. The Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development (MADS) will lead the process assisted by a National Workgroup REDD+ (mesa de trabajo REDD+), in which the main actors are going to be involved. It could seem convenient to include in this workgroup organizations related with the main deforestation and degradation drivers, as mining companies and representatives of farmers responsible of expanding the agricultural frontier. ENREDD+ is, jointly with other three national strategies the basement on the national policy on climate change developed by the National Council For Economic and Social Policies (CONPES 3700). Institutions as the Ministries for Foreign Affairs, Economy, Agriculture, Health, Mining and Energy, Transport Commerce, Industry and Tourism will integrate the National Commission about Climate Change that will be in charge of all the political aspects related with climate change.

The arrangement seems adequate and four thematic workgroups will assist the National REDD+ workgroup, together with scientific support, and the regional nodes on Climate Change (NRCC). The proposal presents in a comprehensive way mechanisms to deal with grievances and conflicts that already has a legal basement.

Early dialogue and information has already began at the Amazonian, Pacific regions, and Orinoquia, and included indigenous communities, afro-Colombian communities, groups of afro-Colombian women and national institutions and NGOs. Results of the meetings ad participants are presented in the body of the document and in an annex

The consultation plan is very comprehensive and will follow the Agreements of Cancun in relation to many safeguards. The plan, presents general ad specific objectives, expected results, issues to be included and, what is more important, a methodology that will distinguish between the different actors involved. Key actors to be involved in the consultation plan are properly presented.

**Conclusion: this standard has been met**

2. Component 2: Prepare the REDD-plus Strategy (maximum 300 words):

Main drivers of deforestation are identified and described. Also indirect causes of deforestation are presented very clearly in table 2a2. Deforestation rates at the national level are also quantified. Eight strategy options and the actions corresponding to each of them are presented in a comprehensive way in table 2b-1- All the actions seem plausible and are aligned with the mentioned deforestation drivers. The options include land use planning, strengthening of communities, promotion of sustainable forest management, and strengthening of governance, development of economic instruments and incentives, promotion of sustainable activities (agriculture, mining, etc.) promotion of the National System of Protected Areas, and conservation and sustainable management in regions in which illegal crops are being cultivated. Cost/benefit analysis of these options is going to be carried out in the near future.

REDD framework, emphasizes in the needs of transparency of the process, although most of the mechanisms for this purpose are going to be developed in the implementation phase.

The SESA section include principles to be considered as well as a three steps work program, that considers information, implementation of the work plan, and implementation of a Framework for Environmental and Social Management (MGAS). Activities to be carried out are describes with detail for the Amazon and Pacific regions.

Risks associated the strategy options are very clearly presented in relation to problems/benefits that could produce on Social Capital, Human Capital, Financial Capital, Physical Capital and Natural Capital.

Taking into account international standards (UN, World Bank), Colombia will develop its own unified safeguards scheme.

**Conclusion: this standard has been met**

3. Component 3: Develop a National Forest Reference Emission Level and/or a Forest Reference Level (maximum 200 words):

Colombia will apply a nested approach for he development of its reference level, developing it first for 9 regions and later proceed to the aggregation to a national level. For this purpose the country developed in the recent years techniques to estimate deforestation base on satellite images with different resolution, which allows also differentiating among forest types. It also has estimation of carbon storage in aerial biomass of forests for 2010. The country developed its own definition of forests and plans to estimate de reference level considering only deforestation, at this stage. It will try to add information on degradation at regional level in a progressive way. It plans to begin is estimation using Tier 1 but develop during the implementation to Tier 3

Considering the different factors affecting deforestation Colombia will develop a model for each region using also multicriteria analysis.

The whole methodology is sound and is based partially in strengths that the country has developed in recent years

**Conclusion: this standard has been met**

4. Component 4: Design Systems for National Forest Monitoring and Information on Safeguards (maximum 300 words):

The document takes into account the international context and the recommendations made in several events, as COP 15 and COP 16 about MRV.

Colombia created the National System for the Monitoring of Forests and Carbon (SMBYC) that will include early warning ( local communities will be very involved in this step), quantification of deforestation and monitoring of Carbon . The second and the third step will be supported by analysis of satellite images, and measurements at the field, including permanent plots .

The system will comprise activities data (those generated by changes in land use, in special deforestation) and factors of emission which will depend on the forest type and the new activity that is installed following deforestation.

The SYMBYC will be based on the MRV and the National Forest Inventory. As with reference level, the MRV will work with a nested approach, considering first the regional scale.

Presently Colombia has developed a robust system for the analysis of different types of satellite images, along with forest inventory and biodiversity surveys at the field.

The estimates of Carbon content in the forests was carried out during the last 20 years in permanent parcels, and with this information the country will be able to estimate emissions, based on deforestation of each of its forest types and the new activity that takes place after forest clearance. Community participation in MRV is described with detail in this section of the document.

For the monitoring of environmental aspects and processes, the country developed the National System of Environmental Information (SIAC), that includes a comprehensive list of indicators, at the national and regional level. For the monitoring of social aspects Colombia will follow its methodology based on surveys of quality of life that considers variables related to physical health and those related to the autonomy.

As mentioned in previous sections Colombia will monitor all aspects related with “ means of life” that include variables associated with Human Capital, Physical Capital, Social Capital, Natural Capital, and Economic Capital,

Despite the fact that governance and its importance is considered in several sections of the document, this component lacks if a section describing with more detail in which way this important aspect will be carried out.

**Conclusion: this standard has been met**

5. Component 5: Schedule and Budget (maximum 300 words):

The budget is very well presented. It is to highlight that Colombia will accede to a variety of funding sources, among them the government itself. FCPF, UN- REDD, GIZ, BMU, IDLO, Embassy of the Netherlands, USAID, GEF and a Foundation, will contribute with funds for most of the R-PP sections, The budget presents also the contribution of each donor to the components. The contribution of several donors to the same activity, is a positive aspect, but should be planned with care to avoid possible conflicts arising from different approaches of each of the donors.

Total budget is more than U\$S 27 million. UN-REDD is asked to participate with about U\$S 4 million (more than 10%), concentrated in components 1a, 3, and 4.

The budget reflects well the activities planned for each component, and includes a chronogram of execution for each of them.

**Conclusion: this standard has been met**

6. Component 6: Design a Program Monitoring and Evaluation Framework (maximum 300 words):

In this section the document presents, for each component, items to be monitored, expected result and verification means, following a logical framework. It is very detailed and clearly presented.



---

It includes the UN framework following the National Program UN- REDD+. This scheme details expected results of the National Program, indicators, objectives,, verification means, UN organization involved as well as risks and assumptions.

The section is very well presented with detail and accomplishes what is needed to carry out a monitoring system for the planned activities.

**Conclusion: This standard has been met**

**Suggestions for improving the technical design of the R-PP Document of Colombia (maximum 400 words):**

Provided above