



“PGI-REDD+” Governance Assessment: A Preliminary Framework



Rome, 18 November 2010

www.kemitraan.or.id

WHAT IS **PGI** (Partnership Governance Index)

- It's a tool to assess local governance performance based on a set of objective and measurable criteria
- Its not (only) for naming and or shaming, it is to show local governments and all stakeholders what areas need improvement, with actionable indicators and a clear choice for policy alternatives



www.kemitraan.or.id

PGI-REDD+ Governance Assessment

- Successful REDD requires good forest governance
- Good forest governance must be nested on overall governance system and performance of the localities
- Good governance is *conditio sine qua non* for the success of REDD+

As Recommendation of the First Expert Meeting on **REDD**

- The existence of clear institutional roles and responsibilities
- Effective coordination between institutions and across sector
- Institutional capacity to implement decisions
- Transparent system for the management of budgets and financial flows.

PGI covers of the above issues and beyond

PGI Measures

Clear Institutional Roles, Responsibilities and Coordination at sub-national and national level.

	Participation	Transparency	Fairness	Accountability	Efficiency	Effectiveness
Government	The quality of public hearings in the DPRD in the deliberation of Provincial Regulations. (1)	Publication of Provincial APBD in the web (2)	Allocation in the APBD for the education sector per student adjusted to the price index (3)	(Indicators)	(Indicators)	(Indicators)
- Regulatory Framework						
- Coordination of Development						
- Budget Allocations						
Bureaucracy	(Indicators)	(Indicators)	(Indicators)	BPK's audit opinion to the Provincial APBD (Local Budget) (4)	Ratio between budget for civil servant expenditure (overhead cost) and the provincial program budget (5)	Investment growth.
- Revenue Collection						
- Public Services						
- Regulating Economy						

Government Arena and Participation

Principles Indicators

- The average number of proposed district development programs that are accommodated in the Development Planning Deliberation Meeting (Musrenbang) in the province
- The quality of public hearings in the DPRD in the deliberation of Provincial Regulations.
- The quality of public hearings to discuss the planned APBD (Local Budget)
- Regularly scheduled development coordination meetings between the Governor and the District Heads and City Mayors
- Regularly scheduled development coordination meetings between the Governor and the stakeholders

Government Arena and Transparency

Principle Indicators

- The publication of Local Regulations and Governor Regulations that can be accessed completely through the web
- Publication of KUA (Kebijakan Umum Anggaran or the General Policy on Budget), Financial Note, and PPAS (Prioritas dan Plafon Anggaran Sementara or Priorities and Temporary Budget Ceiling in the web
- Publication of Provincial APBD in the web
- Publication of Local Regulation on Provincial APBD in the web

Government Arena and Transparency

Principle Indicators

- Publication of the implementation of APBD in the website
- Public access to information about the results of coordination meetings between the Governor and districts/cities
- Public access to information about the results of coordination meetings between the Governor and the DPRD
- The time needed to enact Governor Regulations for the implementation of Local Regulations

Government Arena and Fairness

Principle Indicators

- Budget allocation in the APBD for health (excluding civil servant expenditure) per capita divided by the price index
- Allocation in the APBD for poverty eradication per capita adjusted to the price index
- Allocation in the APBD for the education sector per student adjusted to the price index
- Level of discrimination in terms of coordination by the governor with the districts/cities

Bureaucracy Arena and Efficiency

Principle Indicators

1. Ratio between budget for civil servant expenditure (overhead cost) and the provincial program budget.
2. Service for investment-related activities.

Bureaucracy Arena and Accountability

Principle Indicators

- BPK's audit opinion to the Provincial APBD (Local Budget)
- Control instruments by the BKPMD

Bureaucracy Arena and Effectiveness

Principle Indicators

1. Percentage of annual budget of the Provincial Dispenda to the realization of the PAD (Local Revenues)
2. Score of Human Development Index
3. Investment growth.

Extension of PGI to assess

REDD+ Governance

- Similar conceptual framework.
- Due to separate authorities, functions and roles between national and sub-national governments, REDD+ governance is to be assessed at these two levels.
- Additional arenas to be assessed, i.e. Customary/Community Based Authority and Judiciary.
- Additional indicators specific to REDD+ governance, i.e. land tenure, land use planning, etc.
- Incorporating concepts and indicators circulating in the discourse of REDD governance (WRI, FFI)

Draft PGI-REDD+ Framework for Sub-National Level

ARENA	PRINCIPLES						INDEX
	Participation	Fairness	Accountability	Transparency	Efficiency	Effectiveness	
GOVERNMENT: - Regulatory Framework - Coordination of Development - Budget Allocation	The quality of public hearings at Local Parliament on the deliberation of regulations related to REDD+ program (Land Tenure, Land Use Planning).						
BUREAUCRACY: - Revenue Collection - Public Services - Regulating the Economy	The existence of regulations clearly guaranteeing access to livelihood for people surrounding forest/indigenous people.						Expanded indicators are drawn from the following issues: 1. Land Tenure 2. Strategic Environmental studies 3. Spatial Planning 4. Land use planning 5. Revenue Collection and Distribution 6. Economic generation

Draft **PGI-REDD+** Framework for Sub-National Level

ARENA	PRINCIPLES						INDEX
	Participation	Fairness	Accountability	Transparency	Efficiency	Effectiveness	
CUSTOMARY / COMMUNITY BASED AUTHORITY: - Custodian of customary and enforcer of customary laws and regulations.			Complaint & grievance mechanism & conflict resolutions				Expanded indicators are drawn from the following issues: 1. Land Tenure 2. Strategic Environmental studies 3. Spatial Planning 4. Land use planning 5. Revenue Collection and Distribution 6. Economic generation
CIVIL SOCIETY: - Monitoring (watchdog) & advocacy							Public's access to CSO's monitoring and advocacy reports
ECONOMIC SOCIETY: - Holders of Concessions							Ratio of Cost of MRV to CO2 reduction



Government Arena and Participation

Principles Indicators

- The average number of proposed REDD+ programs that are accommodated in the Development Planning Deliberation Meeting (Musrenbang).
- The quality of public hearings at Local Parliament on the deliberation of regulations related to REDD+ program (Land Tenure, Land Use Planning)
- The quality of public hearings at Local Parliament to discuss budget allocated for REDD+ related program.
- Regularly scheduled development coordination meetings among the Governor, District Heads and Mayors on REDD+ progress/issues.



Bureaucracy Arena and Fairness

Principles Indicators

- Equal distribution of income from REDD+ mechanism
- Provide public's access to ongoing knowledge enhancement.
- Access to education
- Percentage of medically supported birth (doctor and midwife) to the total number of birth.
- Recognition of land rights to forest dependant and indigenous peoples

Customary/ Community Based Authority Arena and Accountability

Principles Indicators

- Documentation and reports on decisions, procedures, revenues, and revenues distributions are available.
- Complaint & grievance mechanism & conflict resolutions

Civil Society Arena and Transparency

Principles Indicators

- Public's access to CSO's monitoring and advocacy reports
- Annual report and program report available to public.

Economic Society Arena and Transparency

Principles Indicators

- Length of time needed to achieve targets
- Length of time needed to respond to public complaints and grievances.
- Ratio of Cost of MRV to CO2 reduction
- Ratio of Cost of Implementing REDD to CO2 Reduction
- Ratio of cost of Compensation to Opportunity Cost of REDD Implementation

Draft PGI-REDD+ Framework

for National Level

ARENA	PRINCIPLES						INDEX
	Participation	Fairness	Accountability	Transparency	Efficiency	Effectiveness	
GOVERNMENT: -Regulatory Framework -Budget Allocation -Coordination of Development -Forest Management	The average number of proposed REDD+ programs that are accommodated in the Development Planning Deliberation Meeting (Musrenbang)	Coherency of policies related to spatial plan, land use, resource extraction/exploitation permit, for REDD+					Expanded indicators are drawn from the following issues: 1. Access of Forest Dependant Peoples to Forest Land 2. Strategic Environmental studies 3. Spatial Planning 4. Revenue Collection and Distribution 5. Economic Incentives
BUREAUCRACY: -Revenue Collection -Public Services -Regulating Economy			State's Audit findings on REDD+ related activities.	Public's access to detailed financial revenues on REDD+ programs.			



Draft PGI-REDD+ Framework

for National Level

ARENA	PRINCIPLES						INDEX
	Participation	Fairness	Accountability	Transparency	Efficiency	Effectiveness	
JUDICIARY: - Law Enforcement					Ratio between cases completed investigate and total cases on forest issues	Law establishes alternative systems	
INDEX							

Expanded indicators are drawn from the following issues:

1. Access of Forest Dependant Peoples to Forest Land
2. Strategic Environmental studies
3. Spatial Planning
4. Revenue Collection and Distribution
5. Economic Incentives



Government Arena and Participation

Principles Indicators

- The average number of proposed REDD+ programs that are accommodated in the Development Planning Deliberation Meeting (Musrenbang).
- The quality of public hearings at Parliament on the deliberation of regulations related to REDD+ program
- Regularly scheduled inter-ministries coordination meetings on REDD+ progress/issues.
- Regularly scheduled coordination meetings between the central government (related ministries) national level and local governments on REDD+ progress/issues (sub-national level)

Government Arena and Fairness

Principles Indicators

- Laws and policies are easily understood by all stakeholders, particularly concerning tenure systems, land use planning, and forest management.
- Laws provide for alternative conflict resolution mechanisms.
- Laws and regulation in recognition of the indigenous peoples and forest dependant rights to forest resources.
- Regulation on REDD+ revenue distribution

Government Arena and Fairness

Principles Indicators

- Laws and policies are easily understood by all stakeholders, particularly concerning tenure systems, land use planning, and forest management.
- Laws provide for alternative conflict resolution mechanisms.
- Laws and regulation in recognition of the indigenous peoples and forest dependant rights to forest reources.
- Regulation on REDD+ revenue distribution

Bureaucracy Arena and Accountability

Principles Indicators

- Records of land allocations are maintained properly.
- Public's access to conflict resolution mechanism.
- Public's access to adequate and sustainable financial resources.
- Service standards exists on land tenure administration.