

## Annex VI: Record Comments on Minutes

### Annex VI: Comments and correction on Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Programme Executive Board Meeting (April 3<sup>rd</sup> 2014)

Comment	Agency	Response
<b>General correction</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Correction on Attendant List</li> </ul>	Mr. Koen EVERAERT, Delegation of the European Union to Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<b>Summary of Minutes</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The seventh Cambodia UN-REDD and FCPF Programme Executive Board (PEB) meeting was organized on the 3rd of April at the Raffles Hotel Le Royal, Phnom Penh.</li> <li>- At the outset of the meeting, Co-chairs, Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, UN Resident Coordinator and H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun, Director General of Forestry Administration (FA) gave opening speeches.</li> <li>- Ms. Clare Van der Vaeren noted that 2014 is a key year for both the UN-REDD programme and the FCPF REDD+ readiness project. For the UN-REDD National Programme, it is in its final year and it is therefore important that activities are successfully completed and the funds are fully disbursed. For the FCPF project, 2014 is the first year. Therefore the 7th PEB meeting has two main themes. The first is to review the progress and workplan of the UN-REDD Programme for the rest of 2014, and the second is to review arrangements for the FCPF project and approve its first annual workplan. PEB needs to consider whether the proposed workplan for the rest of year is realistic, and how the FCPF project can best deliver intended results of REDD+ readiness in a most effective manner while ensuring synergies with other supporting initiatives such as the UN-REDD Programme, CAM-REDD and LEAF.</li> <li>- H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun commented that 2013 had been a successful year for the UN-REDD Programme, with the mid-term evaluation completed, and the Technical Teams having been established. Numerous countries expressed an interest in learning from Cambodia, with Thailand, Malaysia, Vietnam, Sri Lanka and Myanmar (twice) visiting to learn about various aspects of REDD+ readiness. He also noted that the recently-released IPCC report highlighted that urgency to act on climate change is clearer than ever, and that therefore the importance of successful implementation of both the UN-REDD Programme and FCPF project is evident.</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN- REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified

<b><u>Decisions and Actions Required</u></b>			
- Concerning the composition of the PEB for the FCPF project, the PEB decided to revisit this issue during the last quarter of 2014, in light of information on the national coordination mechanism.		Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
- The PEB agreed to maintain a Finance and Procurement Officer position under the FCPF project. - The PEB took note of the comments of the Indigenous Peoples’ representative, requested the representative to submit written comments and instructed the RTS to prepare a written response. The PEB also asked the Indigenous Peoples’ representative to ensure that the response is provided to the IP working group.		Mr. Thomas Enters, UN- REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
- The date of next meeting is 7th August, 2014, and the Board meeting itself will be in morning, with an open meeting for information sharing in afternoon. In this light efforts will be made to keep the agenda of the PEB tight and focused on decisions, while time for open discussion will be provided in the afternoon session.		Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<b>Follow up from previous PEB meeting</b>			
<b><u>Comments and discussion</u></b>			
- Mr. Thomas Enters: commented that Cambodia should consider something beyond a mechanism (e.g. a National REDD+ Office, as they have in Viet Nam). - In response, Mr. Peter Iversen commented that an options paper has been produced but not yet presented to the Taskforce. One option is to build on existing Development Partner meetings organized by the European Commission (EC), which bring together all support frameworks.		Mr. Thomas Enters, UN- REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
<b>Progress Update</b>			
- UN-REDD Programme progress update and achievements	by Mr. Khun Vathana	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN- REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
- FCPF update	by Ms. Moeko Saito-Jensen		
<b><u>UN-REDD Programme update and achievements</u></b>			
- Ms. Nina Brandstrup: noted that the PEB appreciates the preparatory work done by the REDD+ Taskforce Secretariat on gathering all the information - Mr. Thomas Enters: complimented the great and swift works done by the RTS on the Glossary and the compendium of COP decisions by noting that they had been circulated to e.g. the UN-REDD Secretariat in Geneva and Viet Nam. Expressed concern that the Newsletter takes a very long time to produce and		Mr. Thomas Enters, UN- REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified

<p>requested the RTS to produce the next issue of Newsletter as soon as possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In response, Mr. Mathieu van Rijn noted that it has implications for the design and methodology for REL/RL. The UN-REDD Programme anticipates that national scale with sub-national as demonstrations will be appropriate for Cambodia.</li> <li>- H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun: Noted that there is still far to go before the completion of the UN-REDD Programme. He encouraged everyone to keep up the good work, to be realistic, and to report to the RTS if there are any delays so that the 8th PEB meeting can review and make suggestions.</li> </ul>		
<p><b><u>On the FCPF update</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Thomas Enters commented on the need for a Finance and Procurement Officer.</li> <li>- Ms. Setsuko Yamazaki: supported Thomas' comment and suggested retaining the current position (under the National UN-REDD Programme) under the FCPF project. Highlighted the importance of strengthening finance and procurement functions to maintain integrity and transparency and accountability by noting that audit findings (recently conducted on the UNDP component of the UN-REDD Programme) were not good.</li> <li>- Mr. Nok Ven: inquired about the difference between the UN-REDD Programme and FCPF project regarding fund management.</li> <li>- In response, Ms. Moeko Saito-Jensen explained that the two programmes support the same outcomes, but the FCPF project has only Forestry Administration as Implementing Partner, and its funding source is the World Bank.</li> <li>- Ms. Chea Lily: inquired whether FCPF work at sub-national level under Outcome 3 with the comment that FCPF should look at capacity building at sub-national level for all stakeholders. Further questioned whether there is any mechanism to support communities.</li> <li>- In response, Mr. Peter Iversen explained that there is significant funding under Outcome 3 to build capacity at sub-national level for example by testing results-based payments, actions that communities might undertake different elements of demarcation, etc. but also noted that this is different from the UN-REDD Programme, which supported voluntary market projects. Remarked that the new initiative, Community-based REDD+ could help support communities.</li> <li>- In response, Ms. Moeko Saito-Jensen remarked this structure will be effective from 1st August, 2014.</li> <li>- Mr. Sovanny Chhum: noted that if government guidelines are used for recruitment of RTS staff there may be</li> </ul>	<p>Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP</p>	<p>Accepted – text modified</p>

<p>an issue because it is unclear how quickly the government can move.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren: the transition should take place as soon as it makes sense – generally agreed on 1st Aug., but taking note of issues raised, the next PEB meeting can reconsider if there are still issues regarding the new RTS.</li> <li>- The PEB agreed to maintain a Finance and Procurement Officer position under the FCPF project.</li> </ul>		
<b>Request for comments/decisions</b>		
<p><b><u>On Budget for the UN-REDD Programme beyond the first quarter</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren: inquired about any plans of the Implementing Partners to spend the budget under Outcome 2 given that its delivery rate is below 60%.</li> </ul>	Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren: noted on the need to conduct a final evaluation of the UN-REDD Programme and asked under which outcome it is budgeted, and which agency would fund the costs.</li> <li>- Ms. Nina Brandstrup: remarked that FAO may be able to shift some funds to cover the shortfall on evaluation costs by noting that FAO currently faces a challenge in delivery.</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
<p><b><u>On Approval of AWP 2014 for the FCPF project</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Setsuko Yamazaki: highlighted the importance of the national-level grievance work under the FCPF project Outcome 1 and noted that UNDP is considering how best to deliver this support. Also noted the importance of gender mainstreaming.</li> <li>- H.E. Dr. Chea Sam Ang: emphasized the need to spend the UN-REDD Programme funds first and requested all stakeholders to speed up the process. Noted that there will be one more chance to review the workplan at the next PEB meeting in case there are activities not expected to be completed.</li> <li>- Mr. Shinichi Tamamitsu: remarked on the need to allocate resources to develop a national strategy if it is to be presented at COP 21 (2015). Also noted that for REL/RL, at least two time points are required - JICA will support one point, but budget is needed to support the 2nd.</li> <li>- Addressing the REL/RL point, Mr. Mathieu van Rijn noted that the UN-REDD Programme is working with JICA on this issue, which is a complex process, but will be achieved</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified

<p><b><u>On Composition of the PEB for the FCPF project</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Nina Brandstrup: remarked that the composition of the PEB under the FCPF project needs to be reconsidered – this can happen towards end of the UN-REDD Programme. Also, given that the World Bank is providing the FCPF project funding, questions a World Bank representative should be invited to attend as observers.</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In response, Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren recalled a discussion on this at a previous PEB which had concluded that in the same way as the management of the UN-REDD MPTF is not a member of the UN-REDD+ PEB, the WB would not be expected to sit on the FCPF Board.</li> </ul>	Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<p><b><u>Decisions</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The PEB approved the AWP and budget for the remainder of year, and agreed to review status of expenditure at its next meeting, looking at delivery rates against each Outcomes, and considering the need for re-allocation across Outcomes. A detailed presentation on progress with budget expenditures and forecast remaining budget would therefore be required.</li> <li>- Regarding the final the UN-REDD Programme final evaluation, the PEB noted that currently ear-marked funds are insufficient and requested FAO to look at supplementing funding.</li> <li>- The FCPF AWP and budget for 2014 were approved.</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Concerning the composition of the PEB for the FCPF project, the PEB decided to revisit this issue during the last quarter of 2014, in light of information on the national coordination mechanism.</li> </ul>	Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<b>Open Discussion</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren: proposed options for the PEB-8 and the open session: to hold 2 meetings back-to-back, or to invite everyone in an open session and have a closed decision making session before or after the session.</li> </ul>	Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia	Accepted – text modified
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Thomas Enters: commented that they should be completely separate and proposed that the PEB can meet first (in a closed meeting), and can then also report back to other stakeholders on important decisions made during the open session.</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP	Accepted – text modified
<p><b><u>Decisions</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The PEB took note of the comments of the Indigenous Peoples’ representative, requested the representative</li> </ul>	Mr. Thomas Enters, UN-	Accepted –

<p>to submit written comments and instructed the RTS to prepare a written response. The PEB also asked the Indigenous Peoples' representative to ensure that the response is provided to the IP working group.</p>	<p>REDD Regional Coordinator, UNEP</p>	<p>text modified</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The date of next meeting is 7th August, 2014, and the Board meeting itself will be in morning, with an open meeting for information sharing in afternoon. In this light efforts will be made to keep the agenda of the PEB tight and focused on decisions, while time for open discussion will be provided in the afternoon session.</li> </ul>	<p>Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia</p>	<p>Accepted – text modified</p>
<p><b><u>Summing up by Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren and H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren summarized the decisions reached during the meeting, commended the RTS for the scope and quality of the preparations made for the PEB, and thanked all participants for their contribution.</li> <li>- H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun: summarized that we have come to an end of this seventh PEB meeting now acting as both PEB for UN-REDD and FCPF. I would like to thanks my Co-Chair Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren for co-chairing this meeting with me. I think we have had a productive meeting with some good discussions and decisions which will help bring the program forward.</li> <li>- I am pleased that we managed to move forward on the annual budget for UN-REDD and that the FCPF project can complement UN-REDD to allow the work to move forward and I will encourage the secretariat to continue to follow all activities closely to make sure that planned activities will be done within the allotted time.</li> </ul>	<p>Ms. Claire Van der Vaeren, Resident Representative UN Cambodia</p>	<p>Accepted – text modified</p>