



CAMBODIA UN-REDD NATIONAL PROGRAMME

Minutes of UN-REDD Programme Executive Board Meeting

Venue: Sofitel Hotel – Phnom Penh

Date: 03 October 2012

Time: 14:30-17:00

Summary of Minutes:

The second Cambodia UN-REDD Programme Executive Board (PEB) meeting was held on the 3rd of October at Sofitel Phnom Penh Phukeetra Hotel, Phnom Penh.

The meeting’s objectives were to provide participants with information on programme progress, introduction of new PEB members representing CS and IP, approve changes to the project document (inception report), and review the programme’s Q4 workplan.

Participants were informed that the programme was running behind schedule, but that important progress had been made during last two months. However, it was stressed the needed to have the Technical Advisors on board, so that technical activities can start being implemented.

Discussions were held on programme progress, CS and IP workshop, changes to the project document and Q4 workplan with participants providing a number of important operational recommendations.

The Q4 workplan was presented. It focuses on the establishment of operational structures of the programme, capacity building, awareness raising and initial identification of the costs of and benefits of existing forest management approaches and how REDD+ can be integrated within these. Comments were provided on this with participants indicating broad support for the workplan but stressing the need for it to be implemented effectively.

Decisions and Actions:

- Recommended to focus on speeding up the Programme implementation and delivery
- Efforts will be made to have technical advisors on board as soon as possible, the option of having an ad-interim advisor should be considered
- UN-REDD Programme Inception report approved
- Changes in the workplan and budget allocation approved and request to take into consideration the urgent need for an increased delivery
- Requested the Taskforce Secretariat to share the documents for the PEB in advance (as specified in PEB ToR)
- Recommended to establish a Consultation Group soon, as well as the Technical Teams under the REDD+ Taskforce
- Need to clarify the request of CSO and IP to have observers
- A USAID representative will be invited as observer from the next PEB meeting (in order to coordinate with SFB project supporting REDD+) *ew*

- The 3rd PEB meeting will be held on the 13th December 2012.

I. The Participants:

Total 40 participants attended the 2nd PEB meeting of which 9 were PEB members, 3 were PEB alternates and 28 were observers.

Please find more detail in Annex I

II. Agenda:

The agenda focused on the introduction of the new PEB members representing CS and IP, on the approval of changes to the project document, on sharing programme progress, and on the review of the programme's Q4 workplan.

Please find more detail in Annex II

III. Meeting discussion:

1. Introduction of the new PEB members representing CS & IP and Short summary of the selection of CS & IP representatives: presented by Mr. Bun Racy – Technical Officer REDD+ Taskforce Secretariat – FiA. Key elements of the presentation included:

- New members representing CS and IP were selected as interim members for at least 6 months
- Process before CS and IP workshop
- CS and IP Workshop and how the selection process was implemented.

Please find more detail in Annex III

Comments and Discussion:

The Co-Chairs thanked Mr. Racy for the presentation, noting that it was important that two new members were selected to participate in the PEB Meeting.

Mr. Vathana (RTS): He clarified the process of selecting the CS and IP representatives. The process started since February and continued in collaboration with funding NGOs, such as FFI, NTFP-EP, NGOFP ToR to select the CS and IP representatives for the PEB. After meeting 5 times, we started to organize the pre-selection meeting of the CS and IP on 10 September which resulted in having 4 candidates from CS and 6 candidates from IP to bring to the workshop selection process. Finally, on 25-27 September a workshop was held to build the capacity and raise awareness on REDD+ to the participants. On the last day of the workshop the two representatives were selected.

Ms. Elena (UNDP): build on lessons learnt and use the same spirit and partnership in setting up the consultation group with the civil society organizations, IP representative, private sector, academic, etc..

→ **The importance of having CSO and IP representatives was noted and the new members were welcomed.**

2. Changes to the Programme document (inception report): presented by Mr. Lun Kimhy, Programme Coordinator. Key elements of the presentation included:

1. Overview of Programme and activities to date *eu*

2. Synergies with existing programmes
3. Updates to the National Programme Document
4. Implementing arrangements and Communication Strategy
5. Consultation and Participation
6. Gender Strategy
7. Capacity Building Strategy
8. Implementation and Financial Management
9. Monitoring and Evaluation
10. Way Forward

Key Changes to Programme Document:

- a. Changes to the management structure
- b. Additional staff within the Secretariat
- c. Sustainable Forest Management Programme no longer providing co-financing
- d. Components 2.3 Benefit Sharing and 2.4 Fund Mechanisms merged
- e. 3.1 Development of Sub-national approach
- f. Changes to the Results Framework
- g. Changes to Fund management arrangements
- h. Changes to process for Workplan approval

Please find more detail in Annex IV

Comments and Discussion:

Mr. Tim Boyle (UNDP on behalf of UNEP): For UNEP activities a draft Small-scale Funding Agreement (SSFA) was sent to the Secretariat. No answer yet. As soon as it is approved the activity can start.

Mr. Koen Everaert (EU): asked for clarification of the secretariat's structure: Secretariat people number and physical locations.

Mr. Lun Kimby (RTS): clarified that Mr. Vathana is the chair and Ms. Sophorn is the vice-chair. A finance and procurement officer will build capacity of the government staff. There are technical officers.

Mr. Khun Vathana (RTS): There are staff from FA, GDANCP, FiA, (admin and technical staff) and UNDP (Programme Coordinator, Finance and Procurement Officer, Communication Officer and Admin and Finance Assistant) that support to the government staff and build their capacity, so that once the Programme phases out, the government will be able to continue to implement the Programme by ourselves. There are also some technical officers from FA, GDANCP, and FiA that are working on reviewing MVR, ToR and concept note, etc. There will be Technical Advisors from UNDP and FAO that will start implementing technical activities.

Ms. Elena (UNDP): She stressed the importance that the support staff help the secretariat to build their capacity and knowledge for granting sustainability. Monitoring the progress on this is also important. She stressed the need to be practical, the cross-ministerial structure have the risk of slowing down processes, however with willingness and good communication, decisions can be taken to move the Programme forward. The inception workshop was held in November (about one year ago). She hoped that the update and requirement that we brought in the process will be useful to move the Programme forward. *EW*

Mr. Douglas (Co-Chair): thanked the participants for their comments and contributions. He also agreed on approving the changes.

He checked against the decision made since last PEB (June 2012): the AWP was signed by co-chairs, including revised PEB's ToR; and CS and IP representatives' were selected and are participating to PEB. He also thanked the secretariat for the good work in coordinating this.

→ **The inception report including the changes to the Project Document was approved. And the decisions made on the last PEB were fulfilled.**

3. UN-REDD Programme Progress: presented by Ms. Ly Sophorn, Vice Chair of the REDD+ Taskforce Secretariat. Key elements of the presentation were:

1. Programme has made progress in a number of key areas:
 - Cambodia REDD+ Taskforce established: procurement of equipment, induction of national staff, and finalising international experts
 - Civil Society and IP engagement: CS and IP representatives selected through a participatory process
 - Technical support: Number of ToR finalized and procurement process being finalised
 - Programme has made progress in Forest Monitoring
2. Challenges during Q3
3. Programme for coming Quarter
4. Financial Status and Utilization

Please find more detail in Annex V

Comments and Discussion:

Ms. Elena (UNDP): commented on the point that Ms. Sophorn mentioned about the difficulty in some processes because there is a need for more coaching and training. She answered that the point was taken into consideration and that it is the also part of the task of the 4 supporting staff sitting in the secretariat to provide capacity development. She updated on the recruitment of the Technical Advisor, the first candidate changed his mind and discussions are ongoing to have somebody as soon as possible.

Mr. Chuop Paris (FAO): is representing Ms. Nina Brandstrup (FAO Country representative). He added some programme progress for the FAO part, focusing on component 4, MRV: there are national consultants to work on forest degradation and classification and data collection for the purpose of national inventory, as well as greenhouse gas emission data. A system for MRV will be in place soon. He recognized that FAO had the same problem as UNDP; the first candidate declined the offer.

FAO waiting for a national inventory and an international consultant supported by DANIDA and co-funded by FAO (start mid-October) to start working with the national consultant to identify the gaps and what is needed; how the system will look like and what are the common methodology for national inventory. He agreed with UNDP on the slow delivery and is confident that the progress will speed up in this quarter when the international consultant will be on board.

He pointed out that FAO and UNDP are part of the UN family, FAO collaborate with UNDP and agreements are taken without any problem.

Mr. Chhith Sam Ath (CSO): briefed about the working of his NGO. NGOF has 3 networks, a network working on REDD+, a network of IP and indigenous right project, and a forestry and plantation network. The networks consist of around 30 NGO representatives and before

coming to the meeting he had a consultation with the members to find any ideas and what they want to bring in to the meeting. He stressed the need to have all information before the meeting, so that he can be well prepared. His group members requested to have observers from the CS and IP, so that they can come along to take minute and to report back to the members. He congratulated the team for the preparation of the Q4.

He suggested 4 priority areas to focus: first he agreed with UNDP that we have to formalize the REDD+ consultation group CS and IP representatives to be function. The second is to consult on the consultation guideline to find out how we can work together. Third, he suggested establishing the national working group to monitor illegal logging activities, especially at the pilot project areas, establish REDD+ focal persons and provide penalty at the community level. Fourth he suggested that REDD+ activities should also be undertaken at community level.

Mr. Koen (EU): Firstly he agreed on the UNDP point to formalize the REDD+ consultation group including CS and IP representatives and he was happy to notice progress in this respect. Secondly he commented on the need to start MRV activities at an early stage. He pointed out the importance to start thinking on what needs to be reported, data to be collected, inventories to be made, land cover/land use data including forest definition., and forest classification. Coordination among partner organizations sector especially in the forestry sector is essential; for example, through technical working on forestry and environment (TWG F&E). He requested a clarification on with the role of CS and IP PEB representatives versus the planned support to civil society groups as mentioned in the UN-REDD AWP 2012.

H.E Chheng Kimsun (Co-Chair): thanked for the presentation and welcomed the CS and IP representatives to the second PEB meeting. They will be able to bring their knowledge to help in making progress of our implementation. He was very happy to hearing that the representative of CS has networks and is very involved in the sector. He thought that it's good to have Mr. Sam Ath representing and reporting back to CS groups or networks. However, he thought it is already enough to have one representative here and there should not be anymore observer to be sitting in the meeting. But as Mr. Douglas mentioned we would take note with the request. He agreed with the request to share the relevant documents before the meeting, so that members are able to review in advance, this will make decision process better and faster. He requested to the Secretariat to take action on this. He also suggested that presentations should include more photos in order to gain a better idea of what happened.

Mr. Khun Vathana (RTS): Some budget is allocated for review the selection process for the next selection and for the capacity building of IP and CS, so that the selected ones can well represent the Cambodia national. He also thanked Mr. Sam Ath for comments and welcome to be part of the members. He also thanked Mr. Koen for all the effort and support and thanked all members for all contribution.

Mr. Douglas (Co-Chair): in regards to the delivery he said that there might be the possibility that on December meeting we may want to look at no-cost extension and send a request. He suggested keeping that in mind also for the preparation of workplans.

Ms. Elena (UNDP): There might be the possibly that we will need to ask for an extension because 50% time already passed, but the delivery rate is still low. She hoped that with the Taskforce Secretariat almost fully staffed there will be a speed up in the implementation of activities. The UN-REDD programme is seen as a government owned and led programme – for this reason it is important that the Government takes actions for moving the programme forward. *eu*

She support the ideas mentioned by Mr. Sam Ath. The ultimate goal of the programme is to help shape up the future Cambodia national strategic for REDD+. She noticed that in the next Quarter there are few elements that are essential for that. In particular, developing the protected areas strategic management plan (under lead of GDANCP), help in implementing part of the national forest programme (under the leadership of the FA), preparing a study on REDD+ and flooded areas, mangrove forests (with FiA), and support to community protected areas and forestry networks to help to stay in touch with each other.

→ **Recommendations and suggested actions were noted (see summary at the beginning).**

4. Review and Approve on workplan (Q4): presented by Mr. Khun Vathana.

The Q4 Workplan of the programme provided an initial overview of the focus areas for the coming six months including:

- Focus areas of the Q4 work plan:
 - o Establishing operational and management structure
 - o Awareness raising and capacity among stakeholder groups Establishing costs and benefits of REDD+
 - o Supporting existing forest management strategies
 - o Developing capacity to conduct MRV and REL work


Please find more detail in Annex VI¹

Comments and Discussion

Ms. Elena (UNDP): The next Quarter will mainly continue the effort to set up the necessary governance bodies, in particular with the establishment of the Consultation Group, the start of operation of the REDD+ Taskforce and the establishment of the 2 Technical Teams under this body. It is a good time because it is expected that the Oddar Mancheay pilot project site will enter into the Carbon Market early next year and it will be the first one in Cambodia.

Also on this regard UNDP received a letter from the Forestry Administration informing that further support is needed to continue the assistance of PACT Cambodia to Oddar Mancheay in order to reach the market. She happily noticed, as explained by the Secretariat during the presentation, that the Q4 work plan included an increased budget for the pilot project activity of this year (component 3) for this purpose.

Mr. Paris (FAO): The budget in component 4 was increased in consideration of delivery. With national consultants and a technical advisor for MRV on board this month and MRV team we hope to implement the activities while waiting another technical advisor coming in December.

Mr. Koen (EU): he suggested focusing on the delivery of the 4th component because to demonstrate performance a well-functioning MRV system is essential. Therefore, we should start and work on that from now on. Perhaps this could be a non regret option to speed up delivery of the UN-REDD programme. He was also happy to hear that the programme is supporting the development of a national protected areas strategic and management plan 

¹ Note: Due to the request to address delivery concerns, the budget for the Q4 workplan was revised during the REDD+ Taskforce Secretariat meeting and some figures in the presentation are different from the final version of the Q4 workplan. In particular: Budget for activity 1.2 increased from \$132,937 to \$201,537 (Technical Advisor, Secretariat staffs travels); Activity 1.4 from \$18,000 to \$33,000 (additional communication materials); 2.2 committed by UNEP from \$15,000 decreased to \$7,500 outcome 4 committed by FAO from \$245,200 decreased to \$152,014.

which is very important. He suggested coordinating this work with MoE and Development Partners through the TWG F&E.

Mr. Douglas (Co-Chair): Thanked for preparations and looked forwards to the partnership, the support that go for the community authorities and any issues working at the forestry and protected areas.

→ **The presented changes to the workplan were approved; delivery concerns should be further addressed.**

5. Open discussion


Ms. Elena (UNDP): She informed the Board that UNDP has been selected by the World Bank (WB) as delivery partner in Cambodia for the FCPF Programme that like UN-REDD aims to support the Cambodia Readiness to REDD based on to the REDD+ Roadmap. At the moment the Regional Office is preparing an assessment note. Final approval by the WB committee is expected in February 2013. Again, to prove our capacity we have to improve in delivery.

Mr. Koen (EU): There should be a progress of integration of REDD and FLEGT activities. The MRV component might be useful for both processes.

Mr. Douglas (Co-Chair): He welcomed that a UN Agency was selected as delivery partner for WB because UNDP can make good use of the experiences gained, the government will continue to work with a familiar partner, and the integration and coordination of on-going activities with those planned in the WB project will be facilitated. The project will require a new project document; therefore there will be the chance to revise any implementing arrangements based on experience. In addition, USAID is in the process to finalize the selection of the implementing partner for its 20 Million dollars project (4 years starting from this month) "Supporting Forests and Biodiversity (SFB)". Details are not known, but the project will clearly have many linkages to REDD+. In fact, the project's overall goal is to provide technical support to improve conservation and governance of forest landscapes to mitigate climate change.) It is expected that a REDD+ demonstration activities will be implemented in the Prey Lang or Eastern Plains Collaborations between the UN-REDD and the activities implemented by the winning NGOs or consortium through the USAID funding will need to be intensified. Therefore he suggested inviting USAID as observer in the PEB.

Mr. Nakata (CAM-REDD): Commented on the national roadmap and the importance and pressure on how to implement it. Also, suggested that UN REDD, CAM-REDD and other groups supporting the roadmap should have a consolidated workplan that facilitate the overview and the coordination role of the REDD+ taskforce. In addition, the Secretariat should be in a good position to coordinate and consolidate this work.

Mr. OK MA, Representative from ITTO: His organization is working to compliment the UN REDD focusing on many aspects in term of the environment issues and community. He looks forward to cooperation and working together.

Mr. NokVen (IP): Suggested to have IP capacity building and awareness raising activities in the workplan. These should be aimed at community, local authority and FA authority and especially in the pilot target areas. All the process and steps should follow the FPIC principle for the IP. 

H.E. Chheng Kimsun (Co-Chair): Thanked for the suggestions and actually for the capacity building at the technical areas activity are planned, however since this programme is very new, not many people are expert in the work and it is the process of learning by doing.

→ **Recommendations and suggested actions were noted (see summary at the beginning).**

Date of Next Meeting: The 3rd PEB Meeting will be the 13th of December. *eu*

.....
The meeting ended at 17:30

Minutes seen and approved by: *✓*

Deam

H.E. Chheng Kimsun
Co-Chair UN-REDD Programme
Executive Board
Director General
Forestry Administration *✓*

ApL M. A

Mr. Douglas Broderick
Co-Chair UN-REDD Programme
Executive Board
Resident Coordinator
United Nations Cambodia *at*

H.E Chheng Kimsun (Co-Chair): Thanked for the suggestions and actually for the capacity building at the technical areas activity are planned, however since this programme is very new, not many people are expert in the work and it is the process of learning by doing.

→ **Recommendations and suggested actions were noted (see summary at the beginning).**

Date of Next Meeting: The 3rd PEB Meeting will be the 13th of December. *eu*

.....
The meeting ended at 17:30
.....

Minutes seen and approved by: *✓*

Chheng

H.E. Chheng Kimsun
Co-Chair UN-REDD Programme
Executive Board
Director General
Forestry Administration *✓*

Mr. Douglas Broderick
Co-Chair UN-REDD Programme
Executive Board
Resident Coordinator
United Nations Cambodia