

National Programme Document Revision table

Country: Cambodia

ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
1	Consider the Task Force to consult with civil society	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation	The Taskforce is a government body and as such can only be staffed by government members. The UN REDD NPD (Section 4.4, page 82) describes how the Taskforce will consult with civil society through their representatives on the Civil Society/NGO Consultation Group, and will respond to comments raised. The Terms of Reference for the Taskforce and the Civil Society/NGO Consultation Group are being developed in consultation with Cambodian civil society. Civil Society and Indigenous Peoples are also represented on the Cambodia UN REDD Programme Board (Section 6, page 120), which approves the Annual Workplan and budgets, and the Taskforce Technical Teams (Section 4.4, pages 82-83), which will undertake the initial technical work on key issues.
2	Willing to test the UN-REDD risk-based approach to social standards	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation	Further details are required on the UN REDD risk-based approach to social standards before a decision can be made, and requirements for the R-PP grant under the Multiple Delivery Partners modality of the FCPF. The Government is also considering other standards (such as the REDD+ Social and Environmental Standards developed by CCBA and Care-International). UN REDD is also developing social and environmental principles and criteria which could be applied in Cambodia (see page 110).
3	Ensure coordination of development assistance initiatives and multiple governance boards	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation	Section 4.4 of the NPD contains detailed descriptions of the government coordination body (the Taskforce) and mechanisms for coordination of development assistance through the Advisory Group (for development

¹ Independent technical review, Secretariat review, Policy Board comment



ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
	Provide more detail on proposed processes or mechanisms for coordinating across levels of government	WRI review	assistance on REDD+) and the Technical Working Groups (TWGs). The Taskforce membership has been expanded to include new sectors such as mines and industry.
4	Clarify whether a dispute resolution mechanisms are accessible for resolving stakeholder conflicts. The document notes that the government has responsibility for conflict resolution, and there are some dedicated mechanisms for resolving land and forest management disputes; however, it is not clear whether these specific mechanisms are only for resource-related conflict or would also be used for stakeholder grievances	WRI review	Conflict resolution mechanisms are included in the Implementation Framework (Section 4.5.3, pages 91, 93, 94, 100), and have been added to the Consultation Plan (Roadmap Section 2; R-PP Section 1c). The UN-REDD Programme is reviewing the issue of grievance mechanisms for National Programmes and will be able to provide additional guidance on this issue (page 100).
5	Include a mention of ongoing FLEGT process in Cambodia	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation	Improvements in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance, and the ongoing FLEGT process have been included in Section 3 of the Roadmap under Draft REDD+ Strategies, 1: “Effective management of Cambodia’s forests, in accordance with existing laws and policies”, b: “Improving Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG)”. This replaced the previous section on “Management of timber and wood energy”. Activities to further understand the contribution of wood energy demand to future emissions has been included in a new section on “research on drivers of deforestation and forest degradation”. (Section 4.5.2, pages 84-89)
6	<p>Prioritise the regional cooperation of law enforcement and MRV</p> <p>Recognize the importance of regional cooperation and coordination that particularly critical in the Mekong Basin. Regional cooperation is also relevant for the MRV component.</p>	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation	The importance of investigating measures to strengthen regional cooperation and coordination, including cooperation on law enforcement and MRV has been added to Section 4.5.2, under the Draft REDD+ Strategies (pages 84-89), strategy 2: “Designing and implementing effective strategies to address drivers from outside the forestry sector”.

ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
7	<p>More clearly articulate the efforts to address illegal logging</p> <p>Provide more detail on potential strategies for improving law enforcement efforts</p>	<p>UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation</p> <p>WRI Review</p>	<p>The draft REDD+ Strategy (Section 4.5.2, pages 84-89) explicitly adopts the National Forest Programme (NFP) as the principle policy planning document for the forestry sector. The NFP contains detailed plans for activities to address illegal logging and strengthen forest law enforcement and governance (Programme 3 of the NFP). A new section has been added to REDD+ Strategy on investigating measures to further strengthen forest law enforcement and address illegal logging under Draft REDD+ Strategies, 1: “Effective management of Cambodia’s forests, in accordance with existing laws and policies”, b: “Improving Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG)”. (Pages 86-87)</p>
8	<p>Recognize the role of policies beyond MAFF that are driving deforestation like agriculture and mining</p> <p>National Programme document is very forestry-focused. Would benefit from non-forestry drivers of deforestation emphasis.</p>	<p>UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation</p>	<p>The importance addressing drivers from outside the forestry sector is in Section 4.5.2, under the Draft REDD+ Strategies (pages 87-88), 2: “Designing and implementing effective strategies to address drivers from outside the forestry sector”. The Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy has been included as a Taskforce member (see pages 81-82); the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Ministry of Land Management and Ministry of Rural Development are already Taskforce members.</p>
9	<p>Need to include valuation of forest ecosystem services, to demonstrate the value of standing forests in comparison with alternative land uses (e.g. land concessions)</p>	<p>Government; NGO Stakeholders; UN agencies</p>	<p>Strategy 1(d) has been re-written to include valuing the multiple benefits of forests in addition to promoting co-benefits. (Section 4.5.2, page 87; page 99)</p>
10	<p>Elaborate more on research to understand drivers of forest degradation</p>	<p>Independent reviews</p>	<p>The contribution of drivers of forest degradation (timber use and wood energy demand) to current and future emissions is unclear, especially if alternative sources of energy are substituted for woodfuel. Relatively little is known about trends in domestic timber use. Activities to further understand drivers of forest degradation have been included (Pages 88, 103).</p>
11	<p>Need to include SESA (Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment) of the candidate REDD+ strategies and</p>	<p>World Bank FCPF requirement; UN agencies</p>	<p>New section on the evaluation of the REDD+ strategies added, including assessments of environmental and social impacts (Pages 88-89, 92, 100)</p>

ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
	Roadmap implementation in order to be eligible for receiving World Bank Forest Carbon Partnership Facility funds		
12	<p>Elaborate more on measures to reduce corruption</p> <p>Discuss problems of corruption in the forest sector more thoroughly and how these issues might be effectively addressed</p>	<p>UN REDD Policy Board Recommendation</p> <p>WRI Review</p>	<p>The problem of illegal activities, particularly in the forest sector, is recognised in the National Forestry Programme and Section 3 of the Cambodia REDD+ Roadmap. In recognition of the problem posed by corruption, the Royal Government approved the Anti-corruption Law in April 2010. This established an Anti-Corruption Unit, which has since initiated a number of high profile investigations. Specifically for the forestry sector, Objective 4 of the NFP (the principle policy document for the forestry sector) is improvements in Forest governance, law and enforcement at all levels, and Programme 3 of the NFP contains detailed plans for activities to address illegal logging and strengthen forest law enforcement and governance. This is summarised on pages 16-17 of the NPD.</p> <p>Specific measures to further strengthen forest law enforcement and address illegal logging have been included in Section 4.5.2 of the UN REDD NPD under Draft REDD+ Strategies, 1: “Effective management of Cambodia’s forests, in accordance with existing laws and policies”, b: “Improving Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG)”. (pages 86-87).</p>
13	Indicate whether existing mechanisms for resolving land disputes are effective accessible to a range of stakeholders	WRI Review	Land-use planning and mechanisms to integrate REDD+ and land titling processes will need to be considered through the REDD+ Readiness Phase. This is recognised in Section 4.5.2 under Strategy 2 (page 88).
14	As the REDD+ Roadmap is further developed, develop more concrete strategy recommendations around improving forest governance such as targeted capacity-building strategies or specific ways to promote accountability and transparency in the forest sector	WRI Review	The NFP contains a detailed set of activities to improve forest governance. Through implementation of the REDD+ Readiness phase these activities will need to be assessed in order to understand if any further interventions are required. Further details on the NFP have been added to the UN REDD Programme Document (pages 19, 83-84, 85).
15	Provide more detail on any lessons learned from implementation of existing funds and pilot projects	WRI Review	Details on existing pilot projects and developing lessons learned from existing funds and pilot projects has been included (pages 89,91,92,93)

ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
16	Fiscal transparency could be further elaborated and needs to be provided beyond the pilots	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendations	Addition: "A critical issue would be to investigate modalities for management of the funds that are transparent and have clear governance arrangements, but remain state revenue. This work would be undertaken by the Benefit-sharing Technical Team, which will include representation from MEF." (Page 91)
17	Include a reference to monitoring of governance or independent monitoring, acknowledging the difficult history with this in the past.	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendations	Section 4.5.3 of the UN REDD Programme Document contains explicit references to the development of independent review of REDD+ implementation. (Page 93)
18	Clarify whether any legal or policy review of tenure arrangements is necessary for REDD+	WRI review	A legal review has already been conducted, see: Oberndorf, R. and Nhean, M. 2010. REDD+ in the Cambodian context. An overview of the policy, legal and governance Frameworks impacting implementation. Report for the Cambodia REDD+ readiness process.
19	Mention the role of non-government actors in enforcement, such as community forestry groups	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendations	The roles of non-government actors are explicitly mentioned throughout the Roadmap in Sections 2 (Consultation and Participation), 3 (Development of REDD+ Strategy) and 4 (implementation Framework). The sections on strategy and implementation are repeated in the UN REDD Programme Document in sections 4.5.2 and 4.5.3 (pages 84-95). Community Forestry groups could play a key role in implementing REDD+, as detailed in the strategy and implementation framework sections. (e.g. Page 90)
20	Use the term Reference Level (for emissions and removals) and Reference Emissions Level (for emissions only) instead of Reference Scenario to be consistent with the UNFCCC texts	Independent Technical Review	Changed throughout the document
21	The assessment of Cambodia National Circumstances should take into account the drivers of deforestation & forest degradation analysis undertaken as part of the REDD+ strategy development	FAO; Independent Technical Review	Moved into Outcome 4 of the Results Framework under the REL/RL output (4.6).
22	To better describe the scope of MRV intervention to be covered by the NP and indicate that resources allocated to MRV	UN REDD Policy Board Recommendations	Following consultation with FAO and other development partners interested in supporting MRV, a detailed budget and workplan for the MRV component has been drawn up. This includes at least \$3 million USD of support from the

ID #	Comment (s)	Source ¹	Addressed in (Page No. and brief description)
	are insufficient and the importance of finding other sources of funding		Government of Japan, and technical advice from JICA and FFPRI (Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute) of Japan. In recognition of the need for further resources, the budget for the MRV component has been increased in the Cambodia UN REDD National Programme document to \$1,160,000, plus the FAO-TCP funds. In addition, \$800,000 has been allocated for MRV activities from the Cambodia R-PP submission (January 2010). The total resources allocated are, we understand, sufficient for the MRV activities proposed.
23	Separate out MRV of forest carbon from Monitoring of social and environmental impacts	Independent technical review	Outcome 4 of the Results Framework covers MRV of forest carbon, monitoring of social and environmental impacts is now under Outcome 2.